# Employment Stereotypes From Three Largest Muslim in Southeast Asia

# Ririn Nopiah<sup>1\*</sup>, Eka Dewi Anggraini<sup>2</sup>, Musdir<sup>3</sup>

<sup>12</sup> Bengkulu University, Indonesia
<sup>3</sup>Sekolah Tinggi Agama Islam Probolinggo, Indonesia

<u>1\*ririn\_nopiah@unib.ac.id</u>; <u>2ekadewianggraini@unib.ac.id</u>; <u>3musdirarflo24434@gmail.com</u>
\*Ririn Nopiah

**How to Cite:** Nopiah, R., Anggraini, E.D., Musdir. (2023). Integrasi-Interkoneksi Pendidikan Pada Sekolah Berbasis Pesantren di SMK Diponegoro Yogyakarta. *JESAIS*, 2(3), 53-65. https://doi.org/10.30631/jseaisv3i2.1662

## **Abstract**

Employment is one of the main instruments of a country in providing social welfare. Society's perception of job often get comparisons between rights and gender. Various factors that cause society to judge employment have certain limitations and assessments. This study to analyzes the comparison of public stereotypes of employment in the three largest Muslim countries in Southeast Asia. This study uses world value survey data batch 7 (2017-2022) with ordered logit analysis. The results shows that Public perception of the primacy of men's rights in getting a job, public perception of the preference of local residents over foreigners in job giving, and public perception of the negative effects of women's emancipation at working are still relative high influenced by individual religiousity level, the role of social capital, democratic level in that country, and variable of demographic.

**Keywords:** Employment Stereotypes, Gender, Rights, Muslim People, World Value Survey, Southeast Asia

### Introduction

Globalization is a multidimensional process of social, economic, political and cultural change. Changes in globalization have become an important part of the influence of workforce diversity. Employment is one of the main instruments of a country in providing the social welfare. Diversity in employment indicates that an organization is more heterogeneous, such as the diversity of gender, age, race, ethnicity, religion, and others (Chan, 2011; Messarra, 2014). Along with social changes and laws or labor laws, employment stereotypes about fair treatment in obtaining a job change (Triana et al, 2015; Marafuga et al, 2017). Changes in the norms and values of society must still be considered in addition to referring to labor laws

(Marafuga et al, 2017). However, public perception of employment is one of the reasons for employment discrimination.

Aoun & Gibeily (2006) stated that religion has a direct influence on overall performance. Religious diversity makes it vulnerable to more conflicts and interpersonal perceptions among workers (Day, 2005). A study by Ghumman et al (2013) proves that religious discrimination at employment reaches 95%. This is due to the diversity in expressing perceptions of employment in the context of religion. In a study by Miller & Kaiser (2001) said that in order to overcome the stigma and perceptions of gender, ethnic and religious discrimination in employment practices, organizational diversity procedures and training are needed. However, the study by Triana et al (2015) shows that perceptions of racial discrimination and one's behavior have a negative relationship with employment.

The role of human capital is an important component in enhancing development including the issue of gender-based job participation (Abraham et al, 2016; Amoateng et al, 2004). Studies in India show that women's job participation tends to be low and decreases due to social and cultural reasons where the social mindset is the status of a housewife (Banerjee, 2019). Most women choose to participate in home-based work which is inseparable from the job of taking care of the household. Most people perceive that women are better off in the private sphere while men act in the public space (Banerjee, 2019).

In addition, the study by Kapsos et al (2014) states that social norms tend to make men have a more important hierarchy at work than women. This causes differences in employment perceptions of gender in sectoral segregation, a determinant of work participation. In addition, women tend to commit to informal work or self-employment at home so that women have flexibility in managing their time (Banerjee, 2019). However, the study by Lagarde & Ostry (2018) shows that women's participation in the labor market has a higher percentage of welfare than men in democracies. Women's motivation to work is influenced by aspirations related to ideals, plans and encouragement to work. In addition, educational factors, circumstances, and household urgent needs (Ermawari, 2016).

In addition, older workers feel different promotion treatment compared to younger workers so that decisions about labor treatment must be based on transparent standards that are not bound by age (Ana et al, 2017). There are many perceptions of gender identity, racial orientation, ethnicity and other socio-demographics, so society needs policies to overcome these problems (Bjelland et al, 2010; Marafuga et al, 2017). Foreign workers are currently an issue that needs attention. Several countries still depend on foreign workers whose numbers are increasing, including in Southeast Asian Muslim countries such as Malaysia, Singapore and Indonesia (Mohamed et al, 2012; Ang et al 2003). This causes the local workforce to not accept these conditions and triggers bad employment stereotypes against their country.

Even though foreign workers contribute to the country's economic growth, they have a moral loss effect on the role of effectiveness and employment opportunities for local workers (Mohamed et al, 2012). Foreign workers tend to be given non-permanent work facilities to reduce dependency. However, this creates a contrasting effect with local workers because local workers assume that they hold the same jobs and duties as foreign workers but local



P-ISSN: 2599-2805; E-ISSN: 2615-6164

workers are employed at will for a long period of time (unlimited time) (Kalleberg, 2000; Ang et al, 2003). Public perceptions of foreign workers trigger the government to encourage and optimize the allocation of public resources based on local workers to maintain their welfare (Liu, & Wang, 2020; Tian et al, 2019; Yang & Guo, 2021; Hu et al, 2022).

However, currently research on gender-based employment stereotypes from religious, social, cultural, and political perceptions has not received much attention, so this is the aim of the research. This study aims to analyze employment stereotypes in terms of the level of religiosity, social capital, and political status, as well as the demography of the three largest Muslim countries in Southeast Asia.

# Literature Review/Analytical Framework

The study by Ghumman et al (2013) proves that religious discrimination at work reaches 95%. This is due to the diversity in expressing perceptions of work in the context of religion. Religion has a direct influence on overall performance. Religious diversity makes it susceptible to more conflicts and interpersonal perceptions among workers (Aoun & Gibeily, 2006; Day, 2005). Women's work participation tends to be low and decreases due to social and cultural reasons where the social mindset is the status of a housewife (Abraham et al, 2016; Amoateng et al, 2004; Banerjee, 2019; Kapsos et al, 2014). However, a study by Lagarde & Ostry (2018) found that women workers have a higher welfare presentation than men in countries with democratic status. Study from Taylor et al (2000) also shows that female workers have a higher probability of mobilizing social support, affiliation for power and power in making work relationships. In addition, women do not prioritize personal interests over position power compared to men (Gino et al, 2015).

The social exchange theory shows that foreign workers will have quite a negative relationship than local workers. This is because foreign workers receive different benefits from local workers. Local workers tend to work extra hours than foreign workers. Foreign workers tend to be given the right to salary, benefits, access to career development and other positive opportunities for a certain period of time. Whereas local workers tend to be given the same rights but perform more extra tasks such as overtime, no career development benefits, positions that tend to be low with longer term work bonds (Aang et al, 2003). In the study Aang et al (2003) concluded that the fair distribution of employment for foreign workers is higher than for local workers in Singapore. The difference is caused by the country's dependence on foreign workers who are considered more competent in their performance and organization. Mohamed's (2012) study on employment perceptions of foreign and local workers found that Malaysian foreign workers affect local union rights thereby reducing local employment opportunities and vulnerabilities in the welfare of local workers.

#### Research Method

This study uses a quantitative analysis method using world value survey data batch 7 (cross-sectional data) using by Stata Software 17.0. The world value survey is secondary data on a survey of values in a particular country so that this data can assess the impact of stability and changes in values over time on the social, political and economic development of countries and communities, which reach 94.5 percent of the world's population with

individual samples. aged 18 years and over. In addition, the unit of analysis in this study is the Muslim community in the three (3) largest Muslim countries in Southeast Asia, namely Indonesia, Malaysia and Singapore (except Brunei Darussalam because no word value survey was conducted in those countries).

In order to find out how the Muslim community perceives employment in their country, this study is divided into three employment assessments, namely: 1) men should have more priority rights than women to get a job; 2) capital owners must prioritize local people over foreign nationals to be given jobs; and 3) women who work and earn more than their partners will almost certainly cause household problems. While the independent variables used in this study consist of social capital, a country's democratic status, and demographic status. The analytical method used is ordered logit analysis. Ordered logit analysis is a regression model with an ordinal dependent variable (has a level/ranking/ordered) (Woldridge, 2016). The analysis model can be written as follows:

#### Where:

Y<sub>1</sub> : public perception of the primacy of men's rights in getting a job

Y<sub>2</sub> : public perception of the preference of local residents over foreigners in job

giving

Y<sub>3</sub>: public perception of the negative effects of women's emancipation at working

Religiousity : level of religiousity

Participation religion: dummy individual participation in religion organization

Participation : dummy individual participation in other organization

Democratic : democratic level of the country

Age : individual age Gender : dummy male

Marital status: dummy marriage (married or other)

Income : income level (lower until upper level of income)
Urban : dummy individual residence area (urban/rural)

 $\alpha_0$ : intercept

 $\beta_1, \beta_2, \beta_3 \dots \beta_9$  : coefficient of variables

ε : error term

i : cross-sectional data

# **Analysis**

This study has a total sample data of 3369 individuals consisting of 2560 individuals from Indonesia, 546 individuals from Malaysia and 263 from Singapore. In this analysis, the

P-ISSN: 2599-2805; E-ISSN: 2615-6164

ordered logistic regression model method is used. Table 1. shows that participation in religious activities, democratic level, gender (men), marital status and individu that living in urban have significant toward stereotype employment that public perception of the primacy of men's rights in getting a job. In model 2 shows that religiousity level, participation in religious activities, age, gender (men), income level, and urban get significant value to effect stereotype employment about public perception of the preference of local residents over foreigners in job giving. And then, for model 3, we found that other participation as social capital, democratic level in the country and individual age affected and significant to stereotype of employment about how public perception of the negative effects of women's emancipation at working.

Table 1. Ordered Logistic Regression From Three Largest Muslim Country in Southeast Asia

	Significant Value (Coef - Standard Error)					
	Model 1	Model 2	Model 3			
	(Y1)	(Y2)	(Y3)			
Religiousity Level	1.008	1.689***	1.112			
	(0.110)	(0.182)	(0.114)			
Participation in Religious Activities	1.331***	0.767***	0.927			
	(0.088)	(0.053)	(0.066)			
Other Participation	0.840	1.164	1.270*			
-	(0.126)	(0.178)	(0.176)			
Democratic Level	1.067***	0.989	0.969**			
	(0.015)	(0.015)	(0.014)			
Age	1.002	0.985***	0.992**			
	(0.002)	(0.003)	(0.002)			
Gender(dummy)	1.495***	1.388***	1.062			
, , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , ,	(0.097)	(0.095)	(0.071)			
Marital Status (dummy)	1.273**	1.085	0.973			
` ',	(0.097)	(0.088)	(0.072)			
Income Level	0.983	1.026***	1.025			
	(0.014)	(0.157)	(0.016)			
Urban (dummy)	0.655***	1.448***	1.102			
` ',	(0.045)	(0.101)	(0.074)			
N	3369	3369	3369			

Standard error in parentheses.

Source: Data is processed by author, 2022

In the religousity level of the respondent, the higher the individual religiousity level, the higher the perception of the preference of local residents over foreigners in job giving. In addition, the role of social capital has a positive effect on the perception of the primacy of men's rights in getting a job, the preference of local residents over foreigners in job giving and perception of the negative effects of women's emancipation at working. Meanwhile, on the democratic level variable, the higher the level of democracy in a country, the higher the perception of prioritizing men in work and thinking that career women will have more problems in household life

<sup>\*\*\*</sup>p < 0.01, \*\*p<0.05,\*p<0.1

For avoid tend to bias and inaccurate interpretation, we use marginal effect value in this analysis. The calculation of marginal effect value get shows in table 2. In religiousity level we found that when someone has a high level of religiosity, the probability that someone perceives to prioritize local workers over foreign workers is 2.5% higher. The role of social capital or participation in religion or otherwise shows that the higher a person's social capital, the higher the probability of employment stereotypes where one agrees with the perception of the primacy of working men, the primacy of local workers and the negative effects of career women on their household.



P-ISSN: 2599-2805; E-ISSN: 2615-6164

Table 2. Average Marginal Effects From Three Largest Muslim Country in Southeast Asia

	Dependent	1		2		3		4		5	
		Coeff.	Std. Err	Coeff.	Std. Err	Coeff.	Std. Err	Coeff.	Std. Err	Coeff.	Std. Err
Religiousity Level	Model 1	0.0002	0.00255	-0.0011	0.01518	-0.00032	0.00452	0.0002	0.0025	0.00142	0.01974
-	Model 2	04653	.009799	010629	.002431	068784	.01401	.12595	.025577	-	-
	Model 3	02626	.025313	.00198	.00193	.017422	.01680	.00685	.00661	-	-
Participation in Religious Activities	Model 1	0066	.001735	001735	.009214	01182	.00278	.00657	.00216	.0516485	.011904
	Model 2	.02357	.00630	.00538	.001495	.034848	.009084	06381	.016619	-	=
	Model 3	.01881	.0176	00142	.00135	01248	.011694	0049	.00457	-	-
Other Participation	Model 1	.00407	.00407	.02420	.02086	.007205	s.00620	00401	.003596	03147	.02707
	Model 2	013450	.01355	003071	.00311	01987	.02007	.0364	.03670	-	-
	Model 3	05922	.03417	.00448	.002641	.03929	.02271	.01544	.00892	-	-
Democratic Level	Model 1	00152	.00036	00904	.00195	002692	.00060	.00149	.00045	.01176	.00256
	Model 2	.000919	.0013	.00021	.000308	.001359	.001996	00248	.00365	-	=
	Model 3	.007769	.00366	000588	.00028	00515	.00242	00203	.0009	-	-
Age	Model 1	000052	.00005	0003106	.00033	000092	.0001	.000051	.000057	.000404	.000435
	Model 2	.00137	.0002	.00031	.00006	.00202	.00034	00371	.0006	-	-
	Model 3	.00203	.00063	000154	.00005	001352	.000420	00053	.00016	-	-
Gender(dummy)	Model 1	00939	.00185	0558	.0090	0166	.00275	.00924	.002553	.0726	.01168
	Model 2	02909	.00621	00664	.00153	04299	.008908	.07873	.01625	-	-
	Model 3	01499	.01659	.00113	.00126	.00994	.01101	.003910	.00433	-	-
Marital Status (dummy)	Model 1	00565	.00191	03358	.01060	01000	.00319	.005559	.002139	.043683	.013818
•	Model 2	00722	.00719	00165	.00166	010679	.01060	.01955	.01944	-	-
	Model 3	.00675	.018387	00051	.001397	00448	.01219	00176	.004793	-	-
Income Level	Model 1	.000402	.000329	.002392	.0019468	.000712	.0005798	00039	.000329	00311	.00253
	Model 2	00229	.001358	00052	.00031	003396	.00198	.0062	.0036	-	-
	Model 3	00614	.00380	000465	.000292	.00407	.0025	.00160	.00099	-	-
Urban (dummy)	Model 1	.00989	.001979	.05879	.009328	.017506	.00298	00973	.00274	07646	.01210
• • •	Model 2	032888	.0064	00751	.00147	048609	.0092	.08900	.01657	-	-
	Model 3	02397	.01668	.00181	.0013	.0159	.01105	.00625	.00435	-	-
N		3369	3369	3369	3369	3369	3369	3369	3369	3369	3369

Standard error in parentheses. \*\*\*p < 0.01, \*\*p<0.05,\*p<0.1

Volume 2, Nomor 3, 2023, 53-65 | DOI: https://doi.org/10.30631/jseais.v3i2.1662

Meanwhile, the variable level of democracy shows that the higher the level of democracy in a country, the higher the probability of one's perception of the primacy of men over women is 0.025%. However, the probability of employment stereotypes regarding the notion that career women experience more household problems is 0.07%. this shows that someone does not agree with the perception that women will experience more household problems when they work.

For table 3 shows that we analyze different pattern from three largest muslim country in Southeast Asia are Indonesia, Malaysia, and Singapore (except Brunei Darussalam because the data of Brunei is not available in WVS data). From the result, we get that in Indonesia, religiousity level, social capital (participation in religious or the other), level of democratic, age, gender (men) influence to stereotype of employment about perception of the primacy of men's rights in getting a job. For model 2, stereotype of employment in Indonesia influenced by religiousity level, social capital in religion participation, age, gender (men), and income level of individu. In model 3, stereotype of employment about perception of the negative effects of women's emancipation at working affected by other participation, democratic level and individual age.

And then, in Malaysia only other participation, democratic level and individual age can affected perception of the primacy of men's rights in getting a job. Meanwhile, gender (men) and marital status of individual influence to perception of the preference of local residents over foreigners in job giving. And also, religiousity level affect to perception of the negative effects of women's emancipation at working. The last, we found that variable religiousity level, democratic level and social capital are giving little impact to employment stereotype in Singapore. Meanwhile demographic variables such as individual age, gender (men) and marital status affect to employment stereotype in that country.

# JSEAIS: Journal of Southeast Asian Islam and Society

Volume 2, Nomor 3, 2023, 53-65 | DOI: https://doi.org/10.30631/jseais.v3i2.1662

Table 3. Ordered Logit Regression Model Based On Country Groups

	Indonesia				Malaysia	•	Singapore			
	Model 1 Model 2		Model 3	Model 1	Model 2	Model 3	Model 1	Model 2	Model 3	
	(Y1)	(Y2)	(Y3)	(Y1)	(Y2)	(Y3)	(Y1)	(Y2)	(Y3)	
Religiousity Level	0.760**	1.572***	1.124	1.192	1.767*	0.932	1.033	1.756**	1.258	
	(0.105)	(0.209)	(0.145)	(0.333)	(0.539)	(0.258)	(0.295)	(0.487)	(0.349)	
Participation in Religious Activities	1.173**	0.943**	0.992	1.375	0.726	0892	1.777**	1.204	0.787	
	(0.088)	(0.065)	(0.079)	(0.282)	(0.174)	(0.186)	(0.475)	(0.398)	(0.228)	
Other Participation	0.727*	1.070	1.324*	0.997	2.429*	0.923	1	1	1	
	(0.123)	(0.180)	(0.199)	(0.333)	(1.295)	(0,304)	(omitted)	(omitted)	(omitted)	
Democratic Level	1.074***	1.009	0.971*	1.050	0.979	0.991	0.985	1.002	0.941	
	(0.017)	(0.017)	(0.017)	(0.039)	(0.040)	(0.034)	(0.071)	(0.079)	(0.071)	
Age	1.005*	0.985***	0.986***	0.991	0.998	1.023	1.014*	0.986	1.013*	
	(0.003)	(0.003)	(0.003)	(0.007)	(0.009)	(0.008)**	(0.008)	(0.008)	(0.007)	
Gender(dummy)	1.171**	1.404***	1.045	3.426***	0.885	0.969	3.291***	1.881***	1.481	
	(0.089)	(0.111)	(0.084)	(0.563)	(0.174)	(0.159)	(0.796)	(0.460)	(0.355)	
Marital Status (dummy)	1.012	1.092	1.009	2.075***	1.218	0.759	1.853**	1.438	0.969	
	(0.092)	(0.105)	(0.091)	(0.397)	(0.282)	(0.145)	(0.485)	(0.371)	(0.252)	
Income Level	0.979	1.038**	1.029	0.974	0.962	0.938	0.950	1.057	0.985	
	(0.016)	(0.177)	(0.018)	(0.039)	(0.048)	(0.037)	(0.065)	(0.078)	(0.076)	
Urban (dummy)	0.864	1.054	1.062	1.048	0.731	1.287	1	1	1	
. • .	(0.078)	(0.093)	(0.093)	(0.259)	(0.208)	(0.291)	(omitted)	(omitted)	(omitted)	
N	2560	2560	2560	546	546	546	263	263	263	

Standard error in parentheses.

\*\*\*p < 0.01, \*\*p<0.05,\*p<0.1

Source: Data is processed by author, 2022

## **Conclusions**

The conclusions in this study generally found that in three largest muslim country in Southeast Asia have employment stereotype tend to relative high. Public perception of the primacy of men's rights in getting a job, public perception of the preference of local residents over foreigners in job giving, and public perception of the negative effects of women's emancipation at working are still relative high influenced by individual religiousity level, the role of social capital, democratic level in that country, and variable of demographic. So that the role of human capital is an important component in enhancing development including the issue of gender-based job participation. Furthermore, the government to encourage and optimize the allocation of public resources based on local workers to maintain their welfare.

## References

- Abraham, Abena Y., Ohemeng, Fidelia N.A., Ohemeng, William. (2016). Female Labour Force Participation Evidence From Ghana. *International Journal of Social Economics*. Vol. 44 (11), pp. 1489 -1505. Emerald Publishing Limited.
- Ang, Soon., Dyne, Linn V., Begley, Thomas M. (2003). The Employment Relationships of Foreign Workers Versus Local Employees: A Field Study of Organizational Justice, Job Satisfication, Performance, and OCB. *Journal of Organizational Behavior*. Vol 24, pp. 561-583.
- Amoateng, Y., Lucas, D., Kalule-Sabiti, I. (2004). South Africa's Human Capital in the 1990s. *Applied Population and Policy*. Vol 1 (2), pp. 123-131.
- Aoun, G., & Gibeily, T. (2007). Report of an International Forum on Managing Diversity. *Emerald Insight*, Lebanese American University Lib,m Beirut.IN, Vol. 26, pp. 67-70.
- Banerjee Madhusree. (2019). Gender Equality and Labour Force Participation: Mind the Gap. *ANTYAJAA*: *Indian Journal of Woman and Social Change*. Vol4 (1), pp. 113-123.
- Bjelland, M.J., Bruyese, S.M., Con Schrader, S., Houtenville, A.J., Ruiz-Quintanilla, A., Webber, D.A.(2010). Age and Disability employment Discrimination Occuptional Rehabilitation Implications. *Journal of Occupational Rehabilitation*. Vol. 20 (4), pp.456-471.
- Chan, A. (2011). *The Challenges of Human Resources Management*. Retrieved from website <a href="http://aassco.com.public/user\_data/challenges-of-human-resources-management.pdf">http://aassco.com.public/user\_data/challenges-of-human-resources-management.pdf</a>
- Day, N.E.(2005). Religion In the Workplace: Correlates and Consequences of Individual Behavior. *Journal of Management Spirituality and Religion*. Vol.2 (1), pp. 104-135.
- Ermawati, Siti. (2016). Peran Ganda Wanita Karier (Konflik Peran Ganda Wanita Karier Ditinjau dalam Prespektif Islam). *Jurnal Edutama*. Vol. 2 No.2, pp. 59-70.
- Ghumman, S., Ryan, A,M., Barclay, L.A.,Markel, K.S.(2013). Religious Discrimination in the Workplace: A Review and Examination of Current and Future Trends. *Journal of Business and Phsycology*. Vol.28(4), pp. 439-454.

- Hu, Haoyu., Wang, Wei., Ye, Fangjin. (2022). Tracking the Role of Self-Employment on Perceptions of Citizenship: Evidence from Urban Migrant Workers in China. *Population Space and Place Journal*. pp. 1-21. DOI: 10.1002/psp.2576
- Kalleberg, A. L. (2000). Nonstandard employment relations: part-time, temporary and contract work. *Annual review of sociology Journal*. Vol. 26, pp. 341–365
- Kapsos, S., Silberman, A., Bourmpoula, E.(2014). Why Female Labour Force Participation is Declining so Sharply in India. ILO Research Paper No. 10. Geneva: ILO.
- Lagarde, C., & Ostry, J.D.(2018). *Economics Gains From Gender Inclusion : Even Greater than You Thought*. IMF Report, Washington, DC. Retrieved from https://blogs.imf.org/2018/11/28/economic-gains-from-gender-inclusion-even-greater-thanyou-thought/
- Liu, T., & Wang, J. (2020). Bringing City Size in Understanding the Permanent Settlement Intention of Rural-Urban Migrants in China. *Population Space and Place*. Vol. 26(4), e2295. DOI:10.1002/psp.2295
- Marafuga, Ana., Didona, Toni., Paradas, Jamila., Cortes, Antonia E., Perera, Mercedes. (2017). Employee Perceptions in the Workplace: Discrimination Work Motivation, Teamwork/ Citizenship, and Locus of Control. *International Journal of Scientific and Research Publications*, Vol. 7, Issue 12, pp. 716 722.
- Messarra, Leila Canaan. (2014). Religious Diversity at Work: The Perceptual Effects of Religious Discrimination on Employee Engagement and Commitment. *Journal of Contemporary Management Research*. Vol 10, No.1, pp. 1-23. DOI: 10.7903/cmr.12018
- Miller, C.T & Kaiser, C.R. (2001). A Theoretical Perpective on Coping With Stigma. *Journal of Social Issues*. Vol. 57, pp. 73-92.
- Mohamed, Ramesh K.M,H., Ramendran, Charles., Yacob, Peter. (2012). The Impact of Employmentt of Foreign Workers: Local Employability and Trade Union Roles in Malaysia. *International Journal of Academic Research in Business and Social Sciences*. Vol. 2, No.10, pp. 530-541.
- Tian, M., Tian, Z., & Sun, W. (2019). The impacts of city-specific factors on social integration of Chinese migrant workers: A study using multilevel modeling. *Journal of Urban Affairs*, Vol. 41(3),pp. 324–337.
- Triana, M.D.C., Jayasinghe, M., Pieper, J.R.(2015). Perceived Workplace Racial Discrimination and Its Correlates: A Meta Analysis. *Journal of Organizational Behavior*. Vol. 36 (4), pp. 491-513.
- Woldridge, Jefrey M. (2016). *Introductory Econometrics A Modern Approach*. Michigan University: United State of America
- Yang, S., & Guo, F. (2021). Urban labour market and de facto citizenship: Understanding migrant's settlement intention in China. *Population Space and Place Journal*. e2520. DOI:10.1002/psp.2520